

# International Paper Presentations (Break out room 2)

## Lessons from the African Burial Ground in New York City: Constructing Cultures and Preserving Histories with Anti-Racist Archaeology

Catherine Chang<sup>1</sup>

### Abstract

As long as the theory and practice of archaeology is color-blind and antiblack, the cultural contributions of both Black scholarship and African descendant communities are underrepresented and overlooked. In the United States, police brutality against Black people cannot be separated from the cultural violence that Black scholars face in their academic institutions and in their daily lives. These situations are directly related to the Sustainable Development Goal 10: Reduce inequality within and among countries (United Nations, 2018). The most relevant targets are Target 10.2 calling for the “social, economic and political inclusion of all, irrespective of age, sex, disability, race, ethnicity, origin, religion or economic or other status” and Target 10.3 “eliminating discriminatory laws, policies and practices” (United Nations, 2018). The African Burial Ground at New York City is a case study of how to respond cultural violence, through the construction of cultures and histories of African descendant peoples, based on Black archaeological scholarship and community engagement. This case study demonstrates both challenges and opportunities related to the Sustainable Development Goal 10 (United Nations, 2018) within the United States, with implications for Thailand and Asian countries that are dealing with reducing inequalities and promoting the social, economic, and political inclusion of all people. Further research about anti-racist archaeology examines how Asian archaeologists

---

<sup>1</sup>Payap University

877 EDSA, West Triangle, Quezon City, PHILIPPINES.

E-mail: catcha74@gmail.com

confront racism within their lives, academy and community advocacy, in the context of racism against Asians as well as xenophobia against migrants and refugees.

**Keywords:** Anti-Racist Archaeology, Partnership for Goals, Quality Education, Reduced Inequalities, Sustainable Development Goals COBIT 2019 framework

## Introduction

### Problem Statement

As long as the theory and practice of archaeology is antiblack and color-blind, the cultural contributions of both Black scholarship and African descendant communities are underrepresented and overlooked. In the United States, police brutality against Black bodies cannot be separated from the cultural violence that Black scholars face in their academic institutions and in their daily lives. Such invisibility and omission have implications for Asia, which needs academic consideration.

### Research Questions

- 1) What were the challenges related to preserving histories and constructing cultures from the African Burial Ground project in New York City?
- 2) What are the lessons learned about preserving histories and constructing cultures that promote peacebuilding?

### Research Purpose

The research purposes are to identify the challenges related to preserving histories and constructing cultures from the ABG project in New York City, and to unearth the lessons learned about preserving histories and constructing cultures that promote peacebuilding.

### Background

In 1991, construction began for the 34-story federal General Services Administration building in lower Manhattan, New York City. The 1966 National Historic Preservation Act mandated research and review before construction. Intact remains were unearthed in the oldest and largest site in US history. From 1630s until 1795, this six-acre burial ground estimated 15,000, maybe 20,000 skeletal remains of free and enslaved Africans. According to Moore (National Park Service website, last updated 2021), under Dutch rule in New Amsterdam, slaves mostly developed this European-style town. Later when the English conquered New Amsterdam renaming it to New York, slaves were still the primary labor force, representing fifteen to twenty percent of the growing population. Shut out of churchyards, the Africans bought this burial ground for their people. Records indicate that this land was divided into subplots and leveled with twenty-five feet of fill, leaving these remains

untouched for almost two centuries. Initially these remains properly handled such as concrete poured on remains and improper storage (Frone, 2015). Civic engagement with Black communities prompted more dialogue and the research with Black archaeologists Mark E. Mack and Michael L. Blakey at Howard University, where the remains were temporarily transferred. In 2003, these remains returned to ABG for reinterment. In 2007, a memorial was erected to commemorate the contributions of all enslaved Africans, followed up with visitor center in 2010. In 2007, through Presidential Proclamation, this monument dedicated to the contributions of the early Africans (Moore, 2021).

### Limitations and Delimitations

This research paper will utilize journal articles, books, and statements from Black archaeologists and non-Black scholars supportive of their work, respecting their perspectives and working together to address their concerns.

### Literature Review

Two themes comprise this literature review. The first theme is anti-racist archaeology. Although the descriptor “anti-racist” might seem like a contemporary term, it is a much older term with another interpretation. It is noteworthy to distinguish between the “anti-racist” historical understanding with the contemporary usage. According to Blakey (2020), the sciences such as biology justified categorizing people according to race, with Caucasians on top. This ordering of races was anti-racist because it asserted the dominance of the Caucasian race over others, but also objectified the contributions from other races. The earliest Black scholars in anthropology and archaeology confronted this objectification against them, as well as the legitimacy of their research. Starting in the 1960s and 1970s, the contributions of African archaeologists gradually emerged, drawing upon the Black scholarship such as W.E.B. DuBois and Frederick Douglass, with African diaspora scholars contributed towards scholarly activism that challenged the prevailing biological determinism. Complementing this analysis is Franklin et al.’s (Franklin et al., 2020, p.755) analysis of the of the “dual rise of African diaspora archaeology and Black representation.” Coming up to speed with the contemporary context, anti-racist archaeology is organized through academic associations such as the Society of Black Archaeologists and European Society of Black and Allied Archaeologists. In 2020, Black and supportive non-Black archaeologists converged for

an online salon and workshops under the theme of “Archaeology in the Time of Black Lives Matter.” In addition to these organizations, curated resource lists with workshop ideas, also support anti-racist archaeology. SBA in collaboration with The Theoretical Archaeology Group (North America) and the Columbia Center for Archaeology) is one example.

The second theme is the relationship between cultural or heritage preservation and peacebuilding. Case studies in Afghanistan, Syria and Iraq abound, and some evaluate the contemporary challenges such as COVID-19 and climate change (Chiaverini et al., 2021). Kelly (Kelly, 2021) emphasizes the importance of local peacebuilding which is related to community engagement within an overall human rights framework. One preliminary limitation of this literature review is the under-representation of sources that examine the impact of cultural violence through racism, on cultural peacebuilding – not because of protracted conflict but because of interpersonal, institutional and structural racism.

## Contribution

Due to the cultural violence of racism in archaeology that connects with Black Lives Matter movement towards racial reckoning in the United States, especially places outside the United States, this research could contribute towards the relationship between cultural preservation and peacebuilding, which has implications for Asia. For more information about potential projects to develop further this research, the reader can turn to the Recommendations section.

## Definitions

### Culture: Dominant and Minority

This paper uses Avruch’s definition of culture as the “socially inherited, shared and learned ways of living of living possessed by individuals by virtue of their membership in social groups” (Avruch, 2002, p.11). Since the two social groups of White archaeologists, are not on the same footing as Black archaeologists, with some exceptional non-Blacks, culture needs to be further understood as “dominant” and “minority.” Dominant culture is the “group whose members that hold more power relative to other members of society,” but minority culture is the “group whose members hold characteristics (emphasis mine) that afford them less power than the dominant culture” (decisionlab.com). While this definition of minority culture is initially helpful, one debate is to clarify what characteristics that Black archaeologists hold, in contrast to White archaeologists. For example, Black and White archaeologists can work in

the same academic institutions, but Black archaeologists might “hold” more credentials and experience, in contrast to the White archaeologists who benefit from mentoring relationships and financial resources.

### **Cultural Violence**

The dominant White culture causes conflict against the minority culture through racism. Although this conflict manifests itself through cultural violence that justifies both direct and structural violence (Galtung, 1996), this paper will focus on cultural violence. For the minority culture, cultural violence for Black archaeologists dismisses their contributions and challenges related to “archaeological knowledge, ethics, behaviour and practice” (Brunache et al., 2021, p.294).

### **Peacebuilding, Structural Peace, Cultural Peace and Anti-Racist Archaeology**

In response, the minority culture seeks peacebuilding through cultural peace in the form of “decolonization” and “dismantling racism” associated with the academic theory and practice of archaeology. Peacebuilding through structural peace in the relationships between archaeology’s academic institutions and societies, and community engagement. Anti-racist archaeology is one way towards cultural peace. To be anti-racist is to dismantle systems and structures of racism that privilege whiteness. Although archaeology as an academic discipline that examines cultures and communities of the historical past, anti-racist archaeology through cultural peace can interrogate historical theory and practices, but also addresses present harms and creates anti-racist future for all (Flewellen et al., 2020).

## **Theory**

This paper will use critical race theory (Ty et al., 2010) to identify and evaluate findings to answer the research questions. According to Ty et al., “critical race theory asserts that powerful interests in society oppress, but the oppression, as far as African-Americans are concerned, is based on centrality of white privilege” (Ty et al., 2010).

## Findings

### **Finding 1.1: Limited biological information about specific African peoples, against which to evaluate findings**

As the principal Black archaeologists for the African Burial Ground project, Mack and Blakey (Mack and Blakey, 2004) identify the lack of relevant categories among African populations, to evaluate their findings. In their words, “the traditional anthropological focus on race has led to the lumping of diverse groups within single categories for comparison,” and affirm that “more diverse data sets enhance our ability to get at the complexity of life and cultural histories” (Mack and Blakey, 2004, p.11).

### **Finding 2.1: Community engagement with African descendant communities is necessary for local peacebuilding**

Community engagement with African descendant communities, for the ABG persisted throughout the project. Throughout the three phases encompassing twelve years from the discovery of remains in 1991, to the reburial and commemoration in 2003 (Frone, 2015, pp. 175-176), African American grassroots activists and scholars, with government intervention, were persistent in their careful attention and value of this project. Mack and Blakey affirm also affirm the role of descendant communities in “local outreach and public education”, exemplified in the creation of the Office of Public Education and Interpretation and seeking “moral compensation” of the descendants with the United Nations Human Rights Commission (Mack and Blakey, 2004, p.15).

### **Finding 2.2: Non-material (space, spirituality and memory) ways of cultural peacebuilding at African Burial Ground**

According to Frone (Frone, 2015, p.6), the ABG is best framed in terms of a triangulation of space, spirituality and memory, because of the visual, spiritual, and spatial representation. She emphasizes space over place that holds the tension of indeterminacy of the origins of the peoples and their previous lives, with the ongoing social experiences of newer memories of descendants and other non-descendant communities. Ancestors’ spiritualities affirm the sacred space of African heritage. Cultural peacebuilding emerged as competing groups contributed their perspectives on the contestation and production of memory.



## Summary and Conclusion

In response to racism as cultural violence, anti-racist archaeology promotes peacebuilding with construction of cultures and histories of African descendant peoples, through Black scholarship and community engagement.

## Recommendations

One alternative is to maintain the status quo, which means that the concerns and contributions of concerns of Black communities and scholarship will experience further social, economic, and political marginalization. Yet according to them, these conditions cannot and must not remain this way.

As an alternative to the status quo, anti-racist archaeology has the potential both to transform the academic discipline as well as to transform society. This case study demonstrates both challenges and opportunities related to the Sustainable Development Goal 10 within the United States, with implications for Thailand and Asian countries that are dealing with reducing inequalities and promoting the social, economic, and political inclusion of all people. To strengthen these efforts, Sustainable Development Goal 4 involves quality education (United Nations, 2018) that is both inclusive and equitable in the form of anti-racist archaeology.

Further research could examine how Asian archaeologists confront racism within their lives, academy and community advocacy, in the context of racism against Asians as well as xenophobia against migrants and refugees. Similar to the African Burial Ground of New York City, these Asian researchers could review an emblematic site to unearth further insights into anti-racist archaeology. This collaboration among academics, researchers, academic and research institutions, could promote the development and growth of anti-racist archaeology, which is in line with Sustainable Development Goal 17 to enhance partnerships for the implementation of all goals (United Nations, 2018).

## Reference

- Avurch, K. (2002). “*Cross-Cultural Conflict.*” in K. Hipel (ed.), *Encyclopedia of Life Support Systems: Conflict Resolution*, Oxford, UK: UNESCO, EOLSS Publishers. Available at eolss.net
- Blakey, M.L. (2020). Archaeology under the Blinding Light of Race. *Current Anthropology*, 61(S22), S183-S197. Retrieved from Web site: <https://doi.org/10.1086/710357>
- Britannica Encyclopedia. (2021, September 21). *Critical race theory*. Encyclopedia Britannica. Retrieved from Web site: <https://www.britannica.com/topic/critical-race-theory>
- Brunache, P., Dadzie, B., Goodlett, K., Hampden, L., Khreisheh, A., Ngonadi, C., . . . Plummer Sires, J. (2021). Contemporary Archaeology and Anti-Racism: A Manifesto from the European Society of Black and Allied Archaeologists. *European Journal of Archaeology*, 24(3), 294-298. doi:10.1017/ea.2021.21
- Chiaverini, R. et al. (2021). *A Story of Change: Success Stories and Lessons learnt from the Culture Cannot Wait: Heritage for Peace and Resilience Project*. International Centre for the Study of the Preservation and Restoration of Cultural Property (ICCROM). Retrieved from Web site: <https://www.iccrom.org/publication/story-change>
- Dominant Culture. (n.d.) Retrieved on April 15, 2022, from Web site: <https://thedecisionlab.com/reference-guide/sociology/dominant-culture>
- Flewellen, A., Dunnavant, J., Odewale, A., Jones, A., Wolde-Michael, T., Crossland, Z., & Franklin, M. (2021). “The Future of Archaeology Is Antiracist”: Archaeology in the Time of Black Lives Matter. *American Antiquity*, 86(2), 224-243. doi:10.1017/aaq.2021.18
- Frohne, A. (2015). *The African Burial Ground in New York City: Memory, Spirituality and Space*. Syracuse University Press.
- Galtung, J. (1996). *Peace by Peaceful Means: Peace and Conflict, Development and Civilization*. Sage Publications.
- Kasanda, Ambassador P.L. (2003, February). Identification and definition of “People of African Descent” and how racial discrimination against them is manifested in various regions.” (Commission on Human Rights: Working Group of Experts on People of African Descent). Retrieved from Web site: [https://www2.ohchr.org/english/events/iypad2011/documents/Working\\_Group\\_on\\_African\\_Descent/2003\\_WGPAD\\_Session/Definition\\_of\\_People\\_of\\_African\\_Descent-PL\\_Kasanda.pdf](https://www2.ohchr.org/english/events/iypad2011/documents/Working_Group_on_African_Descent/2003_WGPAD_Session/Definition_of_People_of_African_Descent-PL_Kasanda.pdf)

- Kelly, L. (2021). *Lessons learned on cultural heritage protection in conflict and protracted crisis. K4D Helpdesk Report*. Institute of Development Studies. DOI: 10.19088/K4D.2021.068
- Mack, M. E., & Blakey, M. L. (2004). The New York African Burial Ground Project: Past Biases, Current Dilemmas, and Future Research Opportunities. *Historical Archaeology*, 38(1), 10–17. Retrieved from Web site: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/25617128>
- Moore, C. (last updated April 26, 2019). *New York's Seventeenth Century African Burial Ground in History*. African Burial Ground in History. Retrieved from Web site: <https://www.nps.gov/afbg/learn/historyculture/african-burial-ground-in-history.htm>
- National Park Service (n.d.). *African Burial Ground: History and Culture*. Retrieved from Web site: <https://www.nps.gov/afbg/learn/historyculture/index.htm>
- Ty, R., Daniels, D.C., & Pongo, T. (2010). *And Justice for All! The Contributions of the African Diaspora to the Enrichment of Critical Theory: Postcolonial Theory and Critical Race Theory*. In Proceedings of the African American Latino/ a American Leadership Conference 2010. DeKalb. Northern Illinois University
- United Nations (2018). *Department of Economic and Social Affairs: Sustainable Development*. Retrieved on June 13, 2022, from Web site: <https://sdgs.un.org/goals/goal10>
- United Nations (2018). *Department of Economic and Social Affairs: Sustainable Development*. Retrieved June 13, 2022, from Web site: <https://sdgs.un.org/goals/goal4>
- United Nations (2018). *Department of Economic and Social Affairs: Sustainable Development*. Retrieved on June 13, 2022, from Web site: <https://sdgs.un.org/goals/goal17>

## How Computer-Assisted Language Learning has the Potential in Promoting Critical Thinking

Nunthika Puthikanon<sup>1</sup>

### Introduction

Technology has become prevalent in many language-learning classrooms around the world. In many developing countries, technology allows people in remote areas to access various resources available on the Internet. Not only does technology provide unlimited resources to students, but it helps develop critical thinking skills among language learners (Arnold & Ducate, 2006; Coster & Ledovski, 2005; Levine, Ferenz, & Reves, 2000; Mat Daud & Husin, 2004; Mike, 1996; Thadpoothon & Jones, 2002). Drills and grammar practice are no longer sufficient to generate successful second language communication. ESL students need to be capable of thinking critically (Coster & Ledovski, 2005; Thadpoothon & Jones, 2002).

In this paper, I will examine how computer-assisted language learning helps develop critical thinking and higher-ordering thinking skills among language learners. First, I will provide definitions of critical thinking and higher-order thinking skills. Then, I will explain how technology can help students develop such cognitive skills in language classrooms.

### Definitions of critical thinking and higher-order thinking

There are various definitions of critical thinking in academic settings. Critical thinking can be thought of as “the intellectually disciplined process of actively and skillfully conceptualizing, applying, analyzing, synthesizing and/or evaluating information gathered from, or generalized by,

---

<sup>1</sup>Thammasat University

2 Prachan Road, Phra Barom Maha Ratchawang, Phra Nakhon, Bangkok 10200, THAILAND.

E-mail: nunthika@hotmail.com

observation, experience, reflection, reasoning or communication, as a guide to belief or action” (Scriven & Paul, as cited in Coster & Ledovski, 2005).

Lewis and Smith (1993) propose the term “higher order thinking” as the thinking that “occurs when a person takes new information and information stored in memory and interrelates and/or rearranges and extends this information to achieve a purpose or find possible answers in perplexing situations” (p. 136). This definition can be further illustrated as the skills students use when they evaluate whether or not to believe an argument or when they make judgments based on claims or evidence given. On the contrary, lower order thinking requires only memorizing previously learned items, such as recall of previously memorized information (Newman, 1990).

However, it should be noted that different learners’ backgrounds may contribute to differences in a person’s requirement of lower or higher order thinking. Therefore, a task that requires lower order thinking for one person may need higher order thinking skills by the other (Lewis & Smith, 1993).

Since the definitions of critical thinking and higher order thinking are only slightly different, in this paper, I will use the term higher order thinking and critical thinking interchangeably to mean the capacity to process and analyze new information in order to reach a decision. This is comparable to the definitions supplied by Barak (2005), who defines critical thinking as the ability to synthesize information from different sources, solve problems, hypothesize, evaluate and make judgments based on the evidence presented (Barak, 2005).

## Definitions of computer-assisted language learning (CALL)

After understanding the concepts of critical thinking, we should then learn the definitions of computer-assisted language learning, since that is the theme of this paper. Warschauer (1999) has described the scene of technology use in language classrooms from 1960 to the present. In the 1960s and 1970s, computers in language classrooms were seen as isolated tools used to provide drill practice to students. In the 1980s, there was a growing communicative role of computers in the language classroom. However, computers were still viewed as an external tool rather than an integrated tool in the language classroom. With the advent of networked computing in the 1990s, computers have become increasingly common in everyday lives. Computer-mediated communication, such as e-mails, chat rooms, blogs (a website where entries are in diary style), instant messengers (a real-time text-based communication between two or more people), and wikis (a type of website that allows readers

to edit its content easily), assists learners in communicating with other people worldwide. Rather than being considered an augmented tool in language learning, computer-mediated communication is seen as a tool that provides an authentic context for authentic interaction and communication vital to language learning. This new function of computer-mediated communication is due to its unique characteristics that offer “text-based, place-independent, time-independent, many-to-many discussion” (Warschauer, 1999, para. 3).

The integration of computers into our daily lives prompts Warschauer (1999) to suggest that we look at computers in the language classroom from the online literacy perspective, which emphasizes language teaching as a way of promoting online reading and writing, rather than the computer-mediated language learning perspective, which sees computers as a tool to encourage language learning.

## Critical thinking and higher-order thinking in the online environment

After the COVID pandemic, technology has become pervasive in modern society. Students must learn how to utilize technology. Similarly, current students must learn to use language critically. They must be able to effectively analyze, synthesize, and evaluate information in order to arrive at conclusions and solve problems. One goal of higher education is to teach students to think critically (Coster & Ledovski, 2005; Fox & McKeogh, 2003). Therefore, this is an excellent opportunity for students to strengthen their critical thinking by using computers. Several studies have explored how computer technology, especially online discussion, can facilitate critical thinking. Salmon (1998) suggests that the activities that have the potential to promote critical thinking may include activities that are:

offering ideas or resources; inviting critique; asking challenging questions; articulating, explaining and supporting positions on issues; exploring and supporting issues by adding explanations and examples; reflecting and re-valuing personal positions; critiquing, challenging, discussion and expanding ideas of others; negotiating interpretations, definitions and meanings; summarizing and modeling previous contributions; proposing actions based on developed ideas. (p. 5)

Dede (as cited in Hopson, Simms, & Knezek, 2001) suggests classroom activities that promote higher-order thinking skills as activities that provide:

opportunities for learners to construct knowledge rather than passively ingest information; sophisticated information-gathering tools to stimulate the learner to focus on testing hypotheses rather than on plotting data; collaborative interaction with peers; evaluation systems that measures complex, higher-order skills rather than simple recall of facts. (p. 110)

In higher education, activities that are usually included in developing critical skills include projects that require students to locate and evaluate online resources to set up a topic for discussion (Fox & McKeogh, 2003).

In order to investigate to what extent critical thinking is present in the online environment, Anderson, Garrison, and Archer (2000) proposed a model of community of inquiry in a text-based environment, which comprises cognitive presence, social presence, and teaching presence. In the cognitive presence section, they proposed a practical inquiry model, which is a type of critical thinking model, in an online computer conference as composed of multiple stages started by a triggering event. This stage is described as when an issue or problem that emerges from experience is acknowledged, or it can be a task that the teacher assigns. Then it is followed by the exploration stage, where participants shift between “private and shared worlds – that is, between critical reflection and discourse” (p. 10) to search for more information to help make sense of the situation. The third stage is the integration of information into a coherent concept, and the last stage is the resolution of the problem through practical application.

This practical inquiry model was later put into practice to examine how it can serve as a tool to assess critical cognitive presence in online conferences (Garrison, Anderson, & Archer, 2001). Garrison et al. (2001) suggest that computer-mediated communication should be able to create a community of inquiry, which is a necessary context to develop higher-order thinking. Such a community requires “(re)constructing experience and knowledge through the critical analysis of subject matter, questioning, and the challenging of assumptions” (p. 1-2). They performed a content analysis of online discussions in two graduate-level courses. They found that students’ online exchanges were characterized mostly in the exploration phase, followed by the integration, the trigger, and the resolution phase, respectively. They also emphasized the need for a skilled facilitator to ensure effective interactions in online discussions. This study demonstrates at which stage of the community of inquiry model (Anderson et al., 2000) students utilized critical thinking most. Teachers can use these results

to improve their instruction by focusing on the stage where critical thinking is anticipated to be most prevalent.

Collaboration among learners also facilitates critical thinking skills. Interactions among learners, such as argumentation, negotiation, discussion and construction of understanding, help foster critical thinking among students. Arnold and Ducate (2006) argue that the collaborative nature and the written mode of online discussions allow learners to have more time to reflect on their own and others' postings. Without collaboration, a resolution stage according to the practical inquiry model (see Garrison et al., 2000) of cognitive thinking would be impossible.

## Technology and critical thinking in ESL/EFL settings

After learning the significance of how computers may be used to improve critical thinking in conventional classrooms with English-native speakers, we will now examine how online technology can be utilized in ESL/EFL settings. This section will include examples of online activities that teachers of second or foreign languages can use to develop critical thinking in their classrooms. Implementing technology into the language classroom enables students to learn the language and, at the same time, be equipped with critical thinking skills needed in higher education.

The first type of activity that can promote critical thinking is critical reading activities. Critical reading can also be seen as a subcategory of critical thinking skills. Levine, Ferenz, and Reves (2000) investigate how EFL students develop critical reading skills in a computer-networked environment. Palinsar and David (as cited in Levine et al., 2000) define critical reading as the ability to “clarify purpose, make use of relevant background knowledge, focus on major content, critically evaluate the content, draw and test inferences and monitor comprehension” (p. 2). Fifty-eight advanced-level students were enrolled in EFL academic reading courses at a university in Israel. They used a web browser to gather information online, MS Word to compose their assignments, and E-mail to submit those assignments to the teacher. The instructor used ClassNet, a network that allows the instructor to demonstrate on one computer while projecting the same screen via the network to the entire class, to provide assistance to students. This particular network also allowed her to monitor students' work without interrupting them. The study found that an online reading environment may contribute to the development of critical reading better than the conventional reading setting.



They explain that to complete an online project, students need to read through several web pages and synthesize information from different online sources. This text selection process requires students to evaluate the content of the texts as well as draw and test their inferences. Moreover, computers allow students to isolate problematic texts by highlighting, cutting, and pasting them onto the screen; hence teachers can offer individualized assistance suitable for each student.

A Web-based project is the second activity that can enhance critical thinking. Mike (1996) argues that students have to perform several higher-order thinking tasks when completing an Internet-based project. For example, they have to refine a search term to retrieve the most relevant results. After that, they have to review texts on the websites they receive, and thus require evaluation of texts. Then they have to put all the relevant texts together to construct a meaningful text for them. Students can apply these skills beyond Internet reading. Not only they can receive information from the Internet, but they can also generate information by creating web pages. This type of authoring activity allows students to collaborate with others.

Online discussion is the third viable online activity to foster critical thinking because students have to judge the information they receive and give opinions on a particular topic as can be seen in a study done by Coster and Ledovski (2005). They conducted an action research at Monash University English Language Centre to explore the extent to which online discussion can promote critical thinking among students in an English for Academic Purposes (EAP) program. International students in the program needed to develop critical thinking skills for them to function effectively in academic settings, such as the university setting. Online discussions were used to develop students' language, computer, and critical thinking skills. Students were enrolled in English for Academic Purposed program and were preparing themselves for an IELTS (International English Language Testing System) exam. They participated in an online discussion by posting opinions on various topics that could arise on the IELTS test. Students were found to draw information from online resources and their personal experiences. They also found that this activity provided them with new ideas and vocabulary and writing practice that they could apply to the IELTS test. They also found themselves developing some critical thinking through online discussion without time constraints and criticism.

Concordances are the sixth activity that can be utilized to stimulate critical thinking among EFL students. This was evident in a study conducted by Mat Daud and Husin (2004). They investigated how university students in Malaysia developed critical thinking skills using a

concordancer, a type of computer software that looks through a large body of texts called a corpus and lists every single example of a word to analyze a literary text. They found that students who used the concordancer to analyze words outperformed the control group in their ability to use inductive and deductive reasoning, judge text credibility, and identify assumptions in arguments. However, the percentage of the contribution of the concordancer to the difference in scores was small.

A problem-based activity is the seventh activity that can help ESL/EFL students develop their critical thinking skills. Arnold and Ducate (2006) suggested that a task specifically designed to reach a resolution should be encouraged because it promotes such an advanced stage of cognitive activity. In their study (Arnold & Ducate, 2006), they examined what types of cognitive activity, as described by Garrison et al. (2001), foreign language teachers, including international and American students, engaged in during an online asynchronous discussion. They found that the participants engaged in the exploration and integration stages the most when they wanted to find a resolution to a problem-based activity. These phases demonstrated the students' active use of critical thinking skills.

This paper concludes with a discussion of collaborative learning activities, which are viewed as one method of fostering critical thinking. Computers, especially the Internet, can be used to promote collaborative learning among ESL students and thus foster critical thinking. Thadphoothon and Jones (2002) investigated how the Bamboo Enterprise project, an online community created by the authors, fosters critical thinking among five groups of students. Each group of students would complete Internet-based projects, such as online discussions or web page creation, autonomously. The researchers found that students developed critical thinking, as evident in their ability to “synthesize the collected materials and deliver them at an appropriate language level” (Thadpoonthon & Jones, 2002, p. 19). The online environment also promotes communicative language learning and collaborative learning among students. The authors thus conclude that computer-mediated collaborative learning enriches students' learning experience and is a potential platform to enhance critical thinking.

In conclusion, these online activities can be employed in ESL/EFL classrooms to develop critical thinking. Teachers can select an activity based on the setting, interests, and preferences of their students. I believe that all activities mentioned earlier have the ability to foster critical thinking while simultaneously allowing students to acquire linguistic skills. Additionally, teachers must learn to carefully evaluate student performance. Shirkhani and Fahim (2011) insist that an ongoing assessment is more appropriate than a one-time assessment. In addition,

focusing on the objectives of the activity that helps students to learn to ask questions and form their opinions has more benefits than those focusing on memorizing or giving comprehension answers. Students can also benefit from feedback that focuses on the main content of the answer that promotes critical thinking rather than focusing only on the linguistic features of the answer.

## Conclusion

Technology has a potential role in developing critical thinking among language learners. Online activities can be implemented in ESL/EFL classrooms to enhance critical thinking. Teachers are able to incorporate online activities with characteristics that encourage critical thought. To develop critical thinking, these features include inviting students to examine and evaluate the evidence, critique information, interpret data, share perspectives, make a decision, and solve problems. The World Wide Web allows students to search its extensive texts to find information on a particular topic. For students to find helpful information on the Web, they need to read extensively, evaluate the content of the texts, select relevant information, and synthesize collected materials to construct meaning. This process can hence develop higher-order thinking among students. Online discussion can also enhance critical thinking similarly. It allows students to develop critical thinking when they critique, negotiate, challenge or agree with the ideas of others. Therefore, students can simultaneously learn English and practice critical thinking.

Even though technology has promised the possibility to foster critical thinking in language learning, it should be cautioned that this type of thinking does not automatically happen. It is the teacher's task to construct a learning environment that fosters critical or higher-order thinking (Kern, 2006; Salmon, 1998). They should act as a moderator in online activities if effective and purposeful learning is desired (Salmon, 1998). There are several things teachers can do to ensure that students take advantage of online learning. For example, the teacher may monitor students' use of internet resources and model how they can synthesize information. Also, in an online discussion, the teacher should encourage students to utilize the benefit of time. Teachers should encourage them to spend as much time as they want evaluating texts before posting a message in a discussion. In this way, they will exercise as much cognitive thinking as possible and hence develop critical thinking. In sum, technology can serve as a potential facilitator of critical thinking and higher order thinking for language learners.

## Reference

- Arnold, N., & Ducate, L. (2006). Future foreign language teachers' social and cognitive collaboration in an online environment. *Language Learning & Technology, 10*, 42-66.
- Barak, M. (2005). From order to disorder: the role of computer-based electronics projects
- Coster, J., & Ledovski, V. (2005). *Thinking outside the square: Promoting critical thinking through online discussions*. Paper presented at the 18<sup>th</sup> Annual English Australia Education Conference.
- Fox, S., & MacKeogh, K. (2003). Can eLearning promote higher-order learning without tutor overload? *Open Learning, 18*, 121-134.
- Garrison, D., Anderson, T., & Archer, W. (2000). Critical inquiry in a text-based environment: Computer conferencing in higher education. *The Internet and Higher Education, 2*, 87-105.
- Garrison, D., Anderson, T., & Archer, W. (2001). Critical thinking, cognitive presence, and computer conferencing in distance education. *The American Journal of Distance Education, 15*, 7-23.
- Hopson, M., Simms, R., & Knezek, G. (2001). Using a technology-enriched environment to improve higher-order thinking skills. *Journal of Research on Technology in Education, 34*, 109-119.
- Kern, R. (2006). Perspectives on technology in learning and teaching languages. *TESOL Quarterly, 40*, 183-210.
- Levine, A., Ferez, O., & Reves, T. (2000). *EFL Academic Reading and Modern Technology: How Can We Turn Our Students into Independent Critical Readers? [Electronic Version]*. *Tesl-ej, 4*. Retrieved on November 2, 2022 from Web site: <http://www-writing.berkeley.edu/TESL-EJ/ej16/a1.html>.
- Lewis, A., & Smith, D. (1993). Defining higher order thinking. *Theory into Practice, 32*, 131-137.
- Mat Daud, N., & Husin, Z. (2004). Developing critical thinking skills in computer-aided extended reading classes. *British Journal of Educational Technology, 35*, 477-487.
- Meyer, K. (2003). Face-to-face versus threaded discussions: The role of time and higher-order thinking [Electronic Version]. *Journal of Asynchronous Learning Networks, 7*, 55-65. Retrieved on November 3, 2006 from Web site: [http://www.aln.org/publications/jaln/v7n3/pdf/v7n3\\_meyer.pdf](http://www.aln.org/publications/jaln/v7n3/pdf/v7n3_meyer.pdf)
- Mike, D. (1996). Internet in the schools: a literacy perspective. *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy, 40*, 4-13.
- Newman, F. (1990). Higher order thinking in teaching social studies: A rationale for the assessment of classroom thoughtfulness. *Journal of Curriculum Studies, 22*, 41-56.

- on fostering of higher-order cognitive skills. *Computer & Education*, 45, 231-243.
- Salmon, G. (1998). Developing learning through effective online moderation. *Active Learning*, 9, 3-8.
- Shirkhani, S., & Fahim, M. (2011). Enhancing critical thinking in foreign language learners, *Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 29, 111-115.
- Thadphoothon, J., & Jones, J. (2002). Enhancing critical thinking in language learning through computer-mediated collaborative learning: A preliminary investigation. Retrieved on November 2, 2006 from Web site:  
<http://csdl2.computer.org/persagen/DLAbsToc.jsp?resourcePath=/dl/proceedings/&toc=comp/proceedings/icce/2002/1509/00/1509toc.xml&DOI=10.1109/CIE.2002.1186311>
- Warschauer, M. (1999). CALL vs. electronic literacy: Reconceiving technology in the language classroom. Retrieved on November 5, 2006 from Web site:  
<http://www.cilt.org.uk/research/resfor2/warsum1.htm>